

A History of Chinese Scholarship: Research in the Field of Islamic Philosophy

Alimtohte Shiho

Tohoku University, Sendai, Japan

The study of Islamic philosophy is an interdisciplinary field that involves not only religious studies, but also various fields such as politics and society. Some achievements have been made in the field of Islamic philosophy in China. In terms of research on Islamic philosophy, each research achievement has sorted out and evaluated Islamic philosophy. But as indicated by the subtitle of the latter translated work, there was no breakthrough in the framework from Kundera to Ibn Rushd. The main characteristic of the research is to compare the research results of Western scholars, ancient Chinese philosophical ideas, and the research results of Hui Muslim scholars during the Ming and Qing dynasties in China, and to draw academic nutrition from the works of philosophical masters from ancient and modern times, both at home and abroad, in order to find one's own academic entry point. In the paper, the research achievements on Islamic philosophy in China were summarized from the perspective of academic history.

Keywords: Islamic philosophy, China, Hui Muslim scholars, the Ming and Qing dynasties, academic history

Research on Chinese Islamic Philosophical Thought

In its earlier periods, Islamic society in China was composed of Arab, Persian, Turkic, and Central Asian Muslim immigrants, but that changed during the Ming and Qing dynasties when a long period of Sinicization and localization prompted a critical period of development in Chinese Islamic consciousness and cultural ideology. During this period, intellectuals who were proficient in both Islamic scriptures and Confucianism emerged in the Islamic community of China. It is precisely they who, on the basis of Islamic philosophy and under the influence of Chinese Confucianism, created a new theoretical system in China—Chinese Islamic Studies. The establishment of Chinese Islamism is not only a contribution to Chinese Islam but also to Chinese civilization. In a special sense, it also proves the close relationship between Confucianism and Islam.

Representative figures of this movement include Muslim scholars such as Wang Daiyu, Zhang Zhong, Wu Zunqi, Ma Zhu, Liu Zhi, Ma Dexin, and Ma Lianyan who carried out a significant historical enlightenment movement in Chinese Islamic thought. Wang Daiyu and Liu Zhi in particular made founding contributions to the Islamic system in China. Wang Daiyu was the pioneer of this academic system and creatively explored the purpose, task, content, form, and path of the enlightenment movement. Liu Zhi's ideas always combined Islamic teachings with Chinese Confucianism, following the path opened by Wang Daiyu, and further standardized and refined such ideas. Wang Daiyu's and Liu Zhi's ideas were informed by Islam, Islamic theology, Islamic philosophy, Islamic ethics, and Islamic political science, and by critically absorbing Confucianism, especially the Neo-Confucianism of the Song and Ming dynasties (Sun, 2006 p. 506).

Since the 1980s, some Chinese researchers have dedicated themselves to the study of Chinese Islamic literature and produced in-depth publications. For example: Yu Zhengui, “On the Characteristics of Wang Daiyu’s Religious and Philosophical Thought from the Perspective of ‘Qingzhen Daxue’”, *Gansu Ethnic Studies*, 1982, Issue 4; Feng Jinyuan, “Analysis of ‘Lai Fu Ming’”, *Journal of World Religious Studies*, Vol. 4, 1984 (*Records of Selected Works of Feng Jinyuan’s Religious Academic Works in Sanyuan Collection*, Ningxia People’s Publishing House, 1985, May 5-77 pages); Jin Yijiu, “On Liu Zhi’s Thought of ‘Return’”, *World Religious Studies*, 1990, Issue 1; Wu Yiye, “Enlightenment and Reflection on Wang Daiyu to Liu Zhi: Islamic Thought in 17th Century China”, *Research on the Hui Ethnic Group in China*, 1991, Issue 1; Luo Wanshou, “Analysis of the ‘True One’ Theory of Islamic Philosophy in China”, *Northwest Ethnic Studies*, 1996, Issue 1.

Feng Jinyuan’s article, “Analysis of ‘Lai Fu Ming’”, discusses the Lai Fu Ming, a Chinese Islamic inscription that dates to the seventh year of the Ming Jiajing reign (1528) and was at the Mosque of Nanda in Jinan, Shandong. The first half of the inscription states that Allah’s “giving orders to our people” equates to His “coming” while the second half states that people’s “serving their heavens” is equivalent to “restoring” hence the inscription is sometimes referred to as “coming and restoring inscription”. It consists of 155 characters and has a four-character rhyming style. It does not mention Islamic doctrine but draws a connection between Confucianism and Islamic practice. The first part of the inscription utilizes Zhou Dunyi’s concept of “Tai Chi Tu Shuo” in Song and Ming Neo-Confucianism and Zhang Zai’s philosophical ideas, implying and elucidating Islam’s theory of the primordial essence of Allah and the “great power” of creating all things. The latter part clarifies that by using the theory of mind and nature, as well as the lessons of careful cultivation and respect, one can achieve the realization of Allah and then “become a disciple of creation.” Feng Jinyuan’s (1984) article is the first work by a Chinese Muslim scholar to explain the teachings of Islam and Neo-Confucianism during the Song and Ming Dynasties, which prompted academic interest in the relationship between Islamic and Confucian cultures.

Wu Yiye’s article, “Enlightenment and Reflection on Wang Daiyu to Liu Zhi: Islamic Thought in 17th Century China” argues that social thought in China during the 17th century or the Qing Dynasty has always been a hot topic of academic discussion. Indeed, in the past century or so, traditional Chinese society has undergone unprecedented and profound changes in politics, economy, culture, and science. On the one hand, “Western learning” entered China through introductions by Matteo Ricci, Tang Ruowang, Xu Guangqi, Li Zhizao, and others, as part of a larger trend of Western learning spreading eastward. On the other hand, major changes have also taken place in Confucianism with thinkers such as Gu Yanwu, Huang Zongxi, Wang Fuzhi, Tang Zhen, and others critically analyzing traditional Chinese society and feudal despotism. It is no wonder some say this era is similar to the Renaissance in Europe (Wu, 1991).

In the turbulent years, scholars seem to have overlooked certain trends and changes in Islam in China. Islamic thought of 17th century China is quite distinctive and deserving of its own investigation. Representative monographs in this regard include: Jin Yijiu, *Exploring Islam in China: A Study of Liu Zhi*, Renmin University of China Press, 1999; Sha Zongping, *Chinese Tianfangxue: A Study of Liu Zhi’s Philosophy*, Peking University Press, 2004; Yang Guiping, *Research on Ma Dexin’s Thought*, Religious Culture Press, 2004; Wu Yandong, *Commentary on Chinese Hui Thinkers*, Religious Culture Press, 2004; Liang Xiangming, *Research on Liu Zhi and Islamic Thought*, published and distributed by Lanzhou University in 2004; Sun Zhenyu, *Research on Wang Daiyu and His Islamic Thought*, Lanzhou University Press, 2000; Sun Zhenyu, *Research on Ma Dexin and His Islamic Thought*, Lanzhou University Press, 2002; Sun Zhenyu, *Commentary on Wang Daiyu and Liu Zhi*, Nanjing University Press, 2006; Liu Yihong, *Dialogue between Hui and Confucianism—The Classic of Heaven*

and the Way of Confucius and Mencius, Religious Culture Press, 2006; Liu Yihong, "Dialogue between Hui and Confucianism—A Study of Chinese Islamic Philosophical Thoughts in the Ming and Qing Dynasties", *Chinese Philosophy*, Issue 9, 2005; Liu Yihong, "Dialogue between Hui and Confucianism—The Classic of Heaven and Confucius and Mencius", *Philosophical Dynamics*, Issue 8, 2006; Jin Yijiu, *Research on Wang Daiyu's Thought*, Ethnic Publishing House, 2008.

In *Exploring Islam in China: A Study of Liu Zhi*, Jin Yijiu (1999) systematically presents the life, works, and thoughts of famous Chinese Hui scholar Liu Zhi (cf. 1660-1730), and proposes that Liu Zhi's religious philosophy is neither a reproduction of Islamic thought nor a restatement of Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism. The book covers topics such as Liu Zhi's life, works, and ideological origins before delving into his theories of truth, light, human nature, world, cognition, Four Unifications, and reversion. This is the core of the book, although there are other chapters on related topics, such as religion and ethics (Jin, 1999, p. 349).

Yang Guiping's *Research on Ma Dexin's Thought* is a revised doctoral thesis and the first academic monograph to systematically study Ma Dexin's thought. Yusuf Ma Dexin (1794-1874) was a famous leader of Islam and the Hui ethnic group in Yunnan in the late Qing Dynasty, as well as a renowned scholar with significant impact. Ma Dexin moved between academia and politics throughout his life. On the academic side, he devoted himself to research and wrote several profound theoretical works that promote the integration of Islam and Confucianism in order to enrich and develop Chinese Islamic culture. On the political side, he was born into a turbulent and chaotic society, passively involved in the fierce political struggles and ethnic conflicts in Yunnan, and faced the practical contradictions of politics, ethnicity, religion, and culture. He struggled through an exceptionally tortuous and dangerous life that ended in tragedy, constantly exploring the themes of justice, peace, and rationality in turbulent times. It is not easy to accurately describe a historical figure with such complex experiences, diverse identities, and rich thoughts (Yang, 2004, p. 225).

Wu Yandong's *Commentary on Chinese Hui Thinkers* is an exposition of several famous Hui thinkers in Chinese history and their religious, philosophical, social, political, and ethical views, exploring the trajectory of Hui ideology and its representative figures. The book covers the history and characteristics of ancient Chinese Hui thought and details the lives and thoughts of influential Hui thinkers from the Yuan, Ming, and Qing dynasties.

Critical Biography of Wang Daiyu and Liu Zhi by Sun Zhenyu details the lives and thoughts of two Islamic scholars who made founding contributions to the academic study of Islam in relation to Confucianism. Wang Daiyu pioneered this academic specialization and creatively explored the purpose, task, content, and form of translation, while Liu Zhijin standardized and refined it, making translation more thoughtful and discriminative. This book provides a systematic review of the lives, thoughts, and contributions of these historical figures from the Hui ethnic group and uses them as case studies to explore the positive significance of various aspects of Hui Neo-Confucianism. The book introduces Ming and Qing Hui Neo-Confucianism then discusses the lives, academic contributions, and lasting influence of Wang Daiyu and Liu Zhi (Sun, 2006, p. 506).

Liu Yihong's *Dialogue Between Hui and Confucianism—The Classic of Heaven and the Way of Confucius and Mencius* is dedicated to the study of Chinese Muslims who, under the cultural background of Confucianism, used ancient Chinese philosophical ideas to distinguish between Islamic ideas from Arab countries and traditional philosophical theories in China in attempts to highlight their differences, affirm their commonalities, and find complementary elements between the two. In the book, Liu Yihong discusses the ideological systems of scholars such as Wang Daiyu, Wu Zunqi, Ma Zhu, Liu Zhi, and Ma Dexin. It also includes chapters on the theoretical achievements of Chinese translations, the characteristics of Chinese Sufi thought, the religious nature of

Confucianism and Chinese Islamic thought, and comparative philosophical research methods (Liu, 2006, p. 246).

In Jin Yijiu's book, *Research on Wang Daiyu's Thought*, the author proposes that Chinese Islamic thought since the Ming and Qing dynasties is an integral part of Chinese cultural thought, and Wang Daiyu holds a pioneering position in establishing Islamic religious philosophy with unique Chinese characteristics. However, his ideas have not received due attention or been fully incorporated into the cultural and ideological heritage of China (Jin, 2008). Jin Yijiu conducts a systematic study of Wang Daiyu's ideological system, paying attention to the historical background of Wang Daiyu's academic activities, his life and mentorships, and his works and ideology, including the influence of Islamic thought on his ideas.

There are many other works on Wang Daiyu and Liu Zhi. Looking at the number of journal articles dedicated to the ideas of Wang Daiyu and Liu Zhi, there has been an increase in publications on this topic since 2000: Jin Yijiu, "Sufism and Chinese Islamic Writings", included in the *Collected Works of the Islamic Research Academic Society of the Five Northwest Provinces*; Li Xinghua, "Religious Studies in Chinese Translation of Islam", *Journal of Qinghai University for Nationalities*, 1997, Issue 3; Liang Xiangming, "Liu Zhi's Islamic Theory of Human Nature", *Chinese Muslims*, 2002, Issue 5; Sha Zongping, "Maximizing the Cycle, Ending the End, and Returning to the Beginning: A Preliminary Exploration of the Philosophical Outlook of Liu Zhi, a Hui Thinker in the Early Qing Dynasty" *Hui Studies*, 2002, Issue 2.

In "Religious Studies in Chinese Translation of Islam", Li Xinghua illustrates that Hui Muslim scholars in the Ming and Qing dynasties espoused rich religious ideas in their Chinese Islamic translations, which fall primarily into one of three categories: religious composition, religious purpose, and religious discrimination. This paper makes a systematic exposition of this and argues that the emergence of this religious system is the result of the influence of traditional Chinese thought and the need to adapt to social values (Li, 1997).

In the article "Maximizing the Cycle, Ending the End, and Returning to the Beginning: A Preliminary Exploration of the Philosophical Outlook of Liu Zhi, a Hui Thinker in the Early Qing Dynasty", Sha Zongping explores how Liu Zhi absorbed and transformed traditional Chinese Confucian thought in the process of creating China's Islamic academic system. It is believed that Liu Zhi, with his sacred mission to promote Islamic doctrine in China using his profound traditional Chinese cultural education and systematic research on Islamic doctrine, absorbs the work of Hui sages such as Wang Daiyu and others, resulting in a broad and profound Chinese Islamic philosophy based on "truth theory" and with "human theory" as its main content (Sha, 2002).

In recent years, foreign scholars have begun to include the works of representative figures of the Muslim "Chinese Translation" movement, such as Liu Zhi and Wang Daiyu, in their research. As a result of the integration of Chinese traditional culture and Islamic culture, Chinese Islamic literature and classics have received more and more attention. Some scholars have proposed that, given the contribution of Chinese Islamic literature to diverse Islamic thought, it should enjoy the same status and attention as the literature of other languages. For example, in *Chinese Gleams of Sufi Light: Wang Tai Yu's Great Learning of the Pure and Real* and *Liu Chi's Displaying the Concept of the Real and The Sage Learning of Liu Zhi: Islamic Thought in Confucian Terms*, co-authored by Sachiko Murata, William C. Chittick, and Tu Weiming, the basic viewpoint is that many Chinese scholars do not view the teachings of Hui Confucianism as being in line with mainstream Islam. The main reason for this may be the pauses and gaps in the dissemination of Hui Confucianism caused by the events of the 20th century. Due to the disappearance of systematic education related to Islam, Chinese Muslims must relearn their own religious and ideological traditions and cultural customs, and most of them rely on external sources, especially the works of Western historians.

The *Theory of Natural Nature* by Liu Zhi, the most outstanding Muslim philosopher in China, laid out a systematic and meticulous paradigm for the worldview of Hui Confucianism. The book concisely discusses its basic principles and explains some of the detailed deductions derived from these principles. Liu Zhi's brilliant way of elucidating his philosophical insights is unmatched among Hui Confucian authors. In fact, in portraying the multiple dimensions of Islamic thought and practice in such a systematic, concise, and comprehensive manner, I doubt whether there is a philosophical work in Islamic language that can rival it. So, what exactly is the Hui Confucian worldview? Simply put, it is consistent with the ideas elaborated in many works by great Muslim mentors, theologians, and Sufis. In theoretical terms, this worldview is most succinctly expressed as the fundamental principles of three Islamic ideologies: unity, prophecy, and return (Alimtohte, 2009).

The Study of Islamic Philosophy Abroad

Chinese academics have achieved certain optimistic results in the field of Islamic philosophy in China. As early as the 1930s and 40s, Ma Jian had already translated: (Egypt) Muhammad Abdul, *Islamic Philosophy*, published and distributed by the Commercial Press in 1934; (Germany) D. Bohr, *History of Islamic Philosophy*, Zhonghua Book Company Press, 1958.

The original author of *Islamic Philosophy* was Muhammad Abdul, a renowned modern Islamic scholar in Egypt. This book was originally a handout during his teaching at the Royal School of Beirut, but he later published it as a volume. In Cairo, Egypt, in 1933, Ma Jian translated the entire book into Chinese and published it after revising his original manuscript. The *Islamic Philosophy* systematically discusses the fundamental issues of Islamic doctrine from a Sunni perspective, using philosophy to discuss basic beliefs and doctrines in order to maintain the purity of Islam, oppose various heretical doctrines, and propose a complete set of concepts, categories, and principles. It also provides a general introduction to various viewpoints in the study of Islamic monotheism, "indicating the differences of various doctrines from a distance" without further analysis and evaluation (Abdul, 1934). However, from the perspective of Islamic philosophy, the publication of this book has promoted the study of Islamic monotheism and had a wide impact. It is an important resource for Chinese Muslims who seek to understand Islamic philosophy.

After the 1950s, the study of Arab philosophy did not stop. Regarding the relationship between Islamic and Arab philosophy, Ma Jian states:

Islamic philosophy is Arab philosophy. These philosophers grew up under the Islamic regime, and the vast majority believe in Islam. Therefore, some people call them Islamic philosophers. These philosophers are subjects of the Arab Empire, and their philosophical papers are written in Arabic. Islamic philosophy and Arab philosophy are synonymous. (Abdul, 1934, p. 26)

This is also the mainstream opinion in the international academic community. Reform and development, especially since the 1990s, have emerged one after another. The first works translated into Chinese include: (United States) Majid Fahri, *History of Islamic Philosophy*, translated by Chen Zhongyao, Shanghai Foreign Education Press, 1992; (Japan) Toshihiko Ino, *The Course of Islamic Thought—Keram mysticism Philosophy*, translated by Qin Huibin, China Today Press, 1992; Mousavi, *Arab Philosophy—From Kendai to Ibn Rashid*, translated by Tsai Degui and Zhong Dinkun, Commercial Press, 1997.

These works include contributions to academic conversations on the definition of philosophy, philosophical theories, philosophical research topics, the meaning of philosophy, who first uses the term "philosophy", the working methods of philosophers, the conditions for becoming philosophers, and so on.

The publications authored by Chinese scholars include: Cai Degui, *History of Arab Philosophy*, Shandong University Press, 1992; Qin Huibin, *Questions on Islamic Philosophy*, Today China Publishing House, 1994; Li Zhenzhong and Wang Jiaying, *History of Arab Philosophy*, Beijing Language and Culture University Press, 1995; Chen Zhongyao, *Arabic Philosophy*, Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press, 1995; Cai Degui (editor), *Research on Arab Modern Philosophy*, People's Publishing House, Shandong, 1996; Cai Degui, *Research on Contemporary Islamic Arab Philosophy*, People's Publishing House, 2001; Liu Yihong, *Contemporary Arab Philosophical Trends*, Contemporary China Publishing House, 2001; Wang Jiaying, *History of Islamic Religious Philosophy*, Ethnic Publishing House, 2003; Zhang Bingmin, *A Concise History of Islamic Philosophy*, Ningxia People's Publishing House, 2007; Zhang Bingmin (edited), *The History of Islamic Philosophy*, published by Ningxia People's Publish, 2007.

Cai Degui's (1992) *History of Arab Philosophy* not only provides a useful exploration of Arab secular philosophy but also a systematic introduction to Islamic religious philosophy and various sects, such as the Shariah School, the Sufi School, the Murtaizilai School, the Sincere Comradeship, and the Ashiri School. This is the first book in China that comprehensively and systematically discusses the origin, development, and evolution of Arab philosophy. The book is divided into 18 chapters dealing with key philosophers such as Kendai, Razzi, Farabi, Ibn Sina, Ansari, Ibn Bajal, Ibn Tufeli, Ibn Russid, Ibn Heldun, and others.

After an introduction to Arab philosophy in general, Chen Zhongyao's (1995) *Arab Philosophy* mainly expounds upon scholasticism and mysticism, the Greek influence on Arab philosophers, and key topics of Arab philosophy. It covers the emergence, rise, and decline of Arab philosophy, with attention to important movements, sects, thinkers, theories, and schools of thought (Chen, 1995).

Research on Arab Modern Philosophy, edited by Cai Degui (1996), presents the rich variety of Arab modern philosophy, which is of great value for those who wish to understand the impact of Arab culture and its status in the contemporary world. *Research on Contemporary Islamic Arab Philosophy*, also edited by Cai Degui, compares the three major religions in the Arab world and other minor religions, such as Sabism, Manichaeism, and Baha'i. It includes materials on the philosophies of Islamic fundamentalism, mysticism, existentialism, positivism, rationalism, Marxism, and other trends in social thought. The volume provides a clear analysis of Arab ideology and culture from the perspectives of historical evolution, context, law, and characteristics. It also highlights the diversity of Arab philosophy and emphasizes the national and historical nature of contemporary Islamic Arab philosophy, accurately and comprehensively representing the ideological panorama that is contemporary Islamic Arab philosophy (Cai, 2001).

Wang Jiaying's *History of Islamic Religious Philosophy* is the first academic work in China to detail the history of Islamic religious philosophy and is highly regarded. It is divided into major sections on the prophet Muhammad and the Quran, hadith, Islamic law, the rise of Islamic sects, Sunni schools of thought, Islamic scholasticism, Shia, historical documents of Islamic religious philosophy, fundamentalism, Illuminati, Sufi, Islamic Sufi Brotherhood, Iranian Shia, and the modern era (Wang, 2003).

A Concise History of Islamic Philosophy, edited by Zhang Bingmin, recounts the history of Islamic philosophy from pre-Islamic Arabia to the present day, showcasing its rich content from multiple angles and on multiple levels. Its chapters are divided by historical period: the formation of Islamic philosophy (610-632 AD), Islamic philosophy during the Orthodox Caliphate period (632-661), Islamic philosophy during the Umayyad period (661-750), philosophical ideas during the Abbasid period (750-1258), eight chapters on Islamic philosophy in the early Ottoman Empire (1258-1798), Islamic philosophy in the later Ottoman Empire (1798-

1923), and Islamic philosophy in the modern Eastern world (1923) (Zhang, 2007).

The above-mentioned monographs and edited volumes have sorted and evaluated Arab Islamic philosophy, each with their own unique features. Among them, Wang Jiaying's *History of Islamic Religious Philosophy* is an academic work that elaborates on the history of Islamic religious philosophy in China. It is highly regarded in academic circles and fills a gap in the research of Islamic religious philosophy in the Chinese academic community.

In recent years, domestic scholars have recognized the importance of studying the history of religious thought and have begun to use primary literature to conduct in-depth thematic research on important figures in the history of thought.

Wang Junrong's work on Ibn Arabi's existentialism, *Unity of Heaven and Man, Truthfulness of Things and Me: A Preliminary Exploration of Ibn Arabi's Existentialism*, relies directly on his seminal work, "The Revelation of Mecca", and Abdul Kailim Giri's authoritative Arabic original, "Opening the Door of Mystery". On this basis, the achievements of western scholars, of ancient Chinese philosophy, and of Hui Muslim scholars during China's Ming and Qing dynasties are compared with Sufi mysticism so as to gain insight from the works of ancient and modern Chinese and foreign philosophers and so that the research is based on a solid academic foundation. The reliance on primary materials and their comparison is a new research method in the field of Islamic studies in China, reflecting the author's solid foundation in Arabic language and academic rigor. The author accumulated much information and used this new method to enrich and develop the scientific research on Ibn Arabi through systematic argumentation, which constitutes a breakthrough in the research of Ibn Arabi in Chinese academic circles. The theories, methods, and comments elaborated in the author's publications on this topic have important theoretical significance (Wang, 2006).

Conclusion

Islamic philosophy is a philosophical school within the framework of Islamic culture, which may not necessarily be related to religious affairs or exclusive to Muslims. It is a part of Islamic studies research. For a long time, attempts have been made to achieve coordination between faith, reason or philosophy, and religious teaching in Islam. The study of Islamic philosophy is an interdisciplinary field that involves not only religious studies, but also various fields such as politics and society. Some achievements have been made in the field of Islamic philosophy in China. In terms of research on Islamic philosophy, each research achievement has sorted out and evaluated Islamic philosophy. But as indicated by the subtitle of the latter translated work, there was no breakthrough in the framework from Kundera to Ibn Rushd. The main characteristic of the research is to compare the research results of Western scholars, ancient Chinese philosophical ideas, and the research results of Hui Muslim scholars during the Ming and Qing dynasties in China, and to draw academic nutrition from the works of philosophical masters from ancient and modern times, both at home and abroad, in order to find one's own academic entry point. In the paper, the research achievements on Islamic philosophy in China were summarized from the perspective of academic history.

References

- Abdul, M. (1934). *Islamic philosophy*. Beijing: Commercial Press.
- Cai, D. G. (1992). *History of Arab philosophy*. Jinan: Shandong University Press.
- Cai, D. G. (1996). *Research on Arab modern philosophy*. Jinan: Shandong People's Publishing House.
- Cai, D. G. (2001). *Research on contemporary Islamic Arab philosophy*. Beijing: People's Publishing House.

- Chen, Z. Y. (1995). *Arabic philosophy*. Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press.
- Feng, J. Y. (1984). Analysis of "Lai Fu Ming". *Journal of World Religious Studies*, 6(4), 81-91.
- Jin, Y. J. (1999). *Exploring Islam in China: A study of Liu Zhi*. Beijing: China Renmin University Press.
- Jin, Y. J. (2008). *Research on Wang Daiyu's thought*. Beijing: Ethnic Publishing House.
- Li, X. H. (1997). Religious studies in Chinese translation of Islam. *Journal of Qinghai University for Nationalities*, 23(3), 1-8.
- Liu, Y. H. (2006). *Dialogue between Hui and Confucianism—The classic of heaven and the way of Confucius and Mencius*. Beijing: Religious Culture Press.
- Sha, Z. P. (2002). Maximizing the cycle, ending the end, and returning to the beginning: A preliminary exploration of the philosophical outlook of Liu Zhi, a Hui thinker in the early Qing Dynasty. *Hui Studies*, 12(2), 78-87.
- Sun, Z. Y. (2006). *Critical biography of Wang Daiyu and Liu Zhi*. Nanjing: Nanjing University Press.
- Wang, J. R. (2006). *Unity of heaven and man, truthfulness of things and me: A preliminary exploration of Ibn Arabi's existentialism*. Beijing: Religious Culture Press.
- Wang, J. Y. (2003). *History of Islamic religious philosophy*. Beijing: Ethnic Publishing House.
- Wu, Y. Y. (1991). Enlightenment and reflection on Wang Daiyu to Liu Zhi: Islamic thought in 17th century China. *Research on the Hui Ethnic Group in China*, 1(1).
- Yang, G. P. (2004). *Research on Ma Dexin's thought*. Beijing: Religious Culture Press.
- Zhang, B. M. (2007). *A concise history of Islamic philosophy*. Ningxia: Ningxia People's Publishing House.
- Alimtohte. (2009). *History of Islamic studies in Japan—China Chapter*. Kanagawa: Shumpusha Publishing.