

Hong Kong Civic Education Policy From 1984 to 2014: An Historical Comparative Analysis

Hung Chung Fun Steven

Hong Kong Institute of Education, Hong Kong, China

This paper aims to the analysis of civic education policy of the two governments of Hong Kong, the British Colony before 1997 and the Chinese Special Administrative Region after 1997. Hong Kong people own questionable identities, neither British citizens nor Chinese subjects. Basically, the decolonization showed that the policy of domestication was implemented during the transition period of Hong Kong where the government patronized and empowered the Hong Kong people through enhancing human rights and developing political democratization. After handing over of sovereignty, the education policy made the contents of civic education more patriotic, cultural hegemonic and national ideological. The intentions were quite obviously presented in policy documents and responded in the historical contexts. The historical comparison intends to get the expandable interpretation of the scenario of education policy in this period of Hong Kong.

Keywords: de-colonization, civic education, historical comparison

Introduction: The Statement of the Problem

If historical factors help to analyze policy proposal, initiation and implementation of civic education in Hong Kong, comparison can help to analysis the changes before and after the handover of sovereignty from Britain to China. From 1984 to 2014, these 30 years include the transition period of the British decolonization and the governing under “one country two systems” formula by the People’s Republic of China. That is the Chinese post-colonial or, more seriously, the new stage of re-colonization. It is interesting to understand citizenship building and its education policy adopted by comparing these two kinds of governmental administration. This policy analysis describes and explains the Hong Kong Government’s preparations and intentions for their future citizens or masters.

Hong Kong’s Cantonese speaking majority originate from Guangdong province. Many of them fled to escape from mainland China. Hong Kong can function under the common law framework. Hong Kong people can never acquire autonomy and they are, no more, the ruled. What the governments intended to educate pupils always show the way and the trend that the states or officials wanted to govern their subjects or citizens. The understanding of governmentality describes the intention of policy practice making required citizens through education.

The textual concerns give the document presentation to be put on understanding. The other contextual concerns let the civic education policy be laid in historical situation for more plentiful explanation of policy analysis. This article can help to compare the civic education policy of Hong Kong in the transfer of power.

The 30 years of history of policy initiation and implementation reveal the governmental intention which is hegemonic, ideological and nationalist, sometimes, rational or irrational. If policy reflects the social and political orientation and re-orientation of Hong Kong citizens, this analysis wants to understand the reality of the two governments' educational project of engineering and re-engineering student minds. This study is related to the understanding of preparation and implementation of "one country, two systems". The socialist state allows both communist and capitalist systems to run in which the society is organized and pupils are educated.

Concepts of Citizenship and Education of Hong Kong

As Marshall provided his concepts of citizenship that civic education would be followed this basis for the provision of welfare derives. Civil, political and economic rights are the basic concepts of citizenship and they are institutionalized to our daily lives. However, the expert commentaries are expandable to more ideas. The general noticeable concepts of citizenship can be extended to agree with multiculturalism and globalism, and not to be sexual, gender, cultural, religious and racial discrimination.

If citizenship is merely and simply bounded to the rights and duties of citizens to each other as members of a political entity and to the government, the two governments are the British Hong Kong and the Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China. The government of the British should indicate and carry on its process of decolonization in which case citizenship is patronized and enhanced. The Chinese can follow this concept as community building of Hong Kong but, on the contrary, the re-colonization process of citizenship education can be re-organized to more cultural conservative, hegemonic, nationalistic and patriotic.

Identity is the problem of Hong Kong's governance. We have to explain the dual nature of Hong Kong identification. Hong Kong's identity can be localism and Chinese identity can be nationalized. Hong Kong people can identify themselves as Hongkongers as well as Chinese. The British Hongkongers is not common but the Chinese Hong Kong is acceptable in Hong Kong historical context. If so, the policy balance of these dual natures should be noted.

Method: Historical Comparative Analysis

Historical comparison is helpful for expanding insight into diverse social issues. These methods offer such important insight into perplexing and pertinent social phenomena. Decolonization, rationalization, nationalization, ideology and patriotism are processes that need to be analyzed in order to explain the dynamics of Hong Kong's governance under two types of governments. Civic education policy making is the process that created it. It generally analyzes common structural and institutional factors shaping our society. As a consequence, civic educations that affect pupils hold prominent stand points in comparative historical analysis.

Historical comparative methods explore the characteristics and causes of Hong Kong civic education policy. The researcher classifies three key stages of comparisons in Hong Kong history of civic education policy implementation. Each stage can represent the important initiation or turning point of the civic education policy.

The history of the society and the education system is reinforced by changing and transforming conceptions of the contribution of civic education to the national interest. Two different forms of dual identifications with regional Hong Kong and Chinese ethnicity are forged among Hong Kong residents. The related subject contents are expressed in education documents, acts and reports in Hong Kong. Where

understandings have emerged, they are usually clouded by hegemonic or ideological controversy. The analysis is going to uncover the real situations. With referencing to research questions and to historical comparative analysis, the researchers intent to understand and explain what and why civic education to be initiated and implemented in Hong Kong.

Contents of Study

The civic education policy of Hong Kong underwent continuous changes. It was because that the policy makers intended to implement their soul engineering projects at different context. In order to have clearer understanding and interpretation of this issues, the paper extents to a historical comparative analysis. The areas of study cover with comparison between the transition period from 1984 to June 1997 and the after handover period from July 1997 to June 2014. Each period has a noticeable stage which contains a document of civic education policy issue at that moment. The transformation of civic education policy, of course, can be easily observable.

Initiation of New Civic Education on Political Changes

Two special times were that Hong Kong was introduced political reform with parliamentary elections and the Sino-Joint declaration was presented in 1984 and the finalized education reform after handing over re-organized the Basic Education Curriculum in 2001. There were two documents for civic education issue in 1985 and 2002 respectively. These new generated policies indicated that the two governments want to initiate new projects of civic or citizenship education.

The Curriculum Development Committee of the Hong Kong Education Department issued the guidelines on civic education in schools in August 1985. There was no consultation process but an official document was produced under public pressure and criticism. After handing over of Hong Kong's sovereignty, the new government embarked on serious education reforms. The Basic Education Curriculum was publicized after these controversies and debates. One of the series of 15 booklets in the Basic Education Curriculum Guide was Moral and Civic Education which was issued in 2002. At that moment, education reforms were praised to the skies. Moral and Civic Education was set as one of the four major educational concerns.

Generally speaking, the curriculum before 1985 in Hong Kong was a-national. Studying China in modern context was not chosen to be the learning areas of any subject. It was a milestone for civic education in Hong Kong. The notion should be put on the subject contents of new initiated civic education which were not adopted previously. Civic education in 1985 showed that modern China was the first time introduced into schooling curriculum in Hong Kong. More dimensions on Hong Kong studies were introduced. The prominent concepts such as rights, freedom and responsibilities were emphasized, but these important concepts of citizenship education did not ever exist in the curriculum of Hong Kong's schooling. Table 1 shows the details of the contents introduced in the areas of Hong Kong and China at different levels of school education.

There directly addressed the prominence of national and political education in Hong Kong context. After the Sino-British Joint Declaration was signed, Hong Kong would be handed over to China and Chinese elements were the inevitable composition. However, through comparing the suggested contents, the contents of Hong Kong were more than those of China obviously. Citizenship education was actually initiated into educational curriculum in Hong Kong in 1985. The subject suggested contents were obviously based on Hong Kong. The current political issues, especially after the Sino-British Joint Declaration confirmed, were address.

Moreover, it outlined the basic understanding of China. Citizenship education was given as the relationship between Hong Kong citizens and the government, their rights and responsibilities. These were the key and major concerns before the handover.

Table 1

The Contents of Hong Kong and China in Civic Education in the 1985 Guidelines

| Hong Kong | China |
|---|--|
| Senior Primary Basic knowledge of Hong Kong's physical environment, its people, its historical and economic development. The government: a. the function of a government, the work of the Hong Kong government, the government and the people. The citizen: rights, freedom and responsibilities. | Senior Primary A basic understanding of the growth and development of China, China's physical environment and human activities, its cultures, Hong Kong's link with china and the region. |
| Junior Secondary Introduction to Hong Kong with basic knowledge of its history, its geographical setting, its people, its industrial, commercial, financial and cultural development. How Hong Kong is governed: a brief description of the administration of Hong Kong, the importance of law and order to community, the government and the people. Rights and responsibilities of a citizen: an understanding of certain basic rights, freedom and responsibilities of a citizen. | Junior Secondary A basic understanding of the history of China, its geographical setting and cultural heritage. Awareness of China's recent political and economic development. An understanding of Hong Kong's cultural, political and economic link with China. |
| Senior Secondary The Hong Kong government: functions and policy making, need for rules and regulations, types of rules in society. The government and the people: representative system under liberal democratic, consultation with people, major official channels for the redress of grievances, informal influences on policy making. Greater understanding of the rights and responsibilities of a citizen. Greater understanding of current issues related to the political, economic, social and cultural development in Hong Kong. | Senior Secondary Greater understanding of the cultural heritage of China and its latest economic developments Greater understanding of Hong Kong's link with China and her role in maintaining stability and prosperity in Hong Kong |
| Sixth-form An analysis of how Hong Kong is governed. Development of representative government and local administration in Hong Kong Modes of participation in Hong Kong's political affairs Major issues in public policy areas in Hong Kong, e.g. housing, law and order, education, medical and health, social welfare, transport. The future of Hong Kong as set out in the Sino-British Joint Declaration. | Sixth-form Basic knowledge of the government and politics of the People's Republic of China. |

After the handover, the goals of the school curriculum were re-set. The Curriculum Development Institute issued the report of *China Elements in the School Curriculum: Curriculum Examination Report* in 1998. It was expressed that students should be able to recognize their roles and responsibilities as members in the family, the society and the nation and show concern for their well-being, and understand their national identity and be committed to contributing to the nation and society (Curriculum Development Council, 2000, p. 18). The hidden agenda was that national identity should be put on the first priority in our education system. It was predictable that, following the handover of sovereignty, civic education should be laid stress on building nationalism and patriotism.

The issued Moral and Civic Education booklet in 2002 set five priority values and attitudes which were perseverance, respect for others, responsibility, national identity and commitment. These values were set without any consultation and assumed to prepare students to meet the challenges of the 21st Century (Education and Manpower Branch, 2002, p. 2). Of course, the researchers might doubt why such values were helpful for the challenges. It was said that the values which were fostered and interconnected should help students to become informed and responsible citizens committed to the well-being of their fellow humans (Education and

Manpower Branch 2002, p. 2). However, the researchers could not explain how these values could help students to become such citizens. They actually adopted nationalist, patriotic and traditional Chinese values and made these be explainable. The core modern rational values were excluded such as the rule of law, democracy and human rights education not being included in generating curriculum content for the reform of basic education system. More actually, the priority of the priorities was national identity. The return of Hong Kong to China since 1997 called for a deeper understanding of the history and culture of China. The document expressed that there was a need to strengthen the sense of national identity among students (Education and Manpower Branch, 2002, p. 3). It was imperative to enhance pupils' interest in and concern for the development of China through involving them in different learning experiences and life-wide learning. More opportunities must be provided for pupils to develop a sense of belonging to China (Education and Manpower Branch 2002, p. 3). It could be nurtured through developing in students an understanding and appreciation of the achievements of China (Education and Manpower Branch, 2002, p. 15). The national flag-raising ceremony were recognized as real life learning experiences at the Tiananmen Square by visiting to the mainland or at the Golden Bauhinia Square in Hong Kong which could provide the opportunities to develop their nation identity (Education and Manpower Branch, 2002, p. 16, p. 27, p. 30, p. 34). But it is not to educate, it is only ritualism or hegemonic to indoctrinate or imperceptible to influence. It is not a rational way of education in order to nurture our future and responsible citizens. The continuous studies by surveys find that students hate to identify themselves as Chinese. Ritualism cannot be effectual.

In addition to citizenship education building, a new kind of socialist and collective citizenship might be required by fostering Hong Kong's students a national identity which might resemble a pan-Chinese identity, but Hong Kong's students still strongly identify themselves as Hongkongers which are proved by many surveys.

Middle Evaluation of Civic Education by Chinese Official Institutions

When the day of the handover came near, the Chinese government organized the Preliminary Working Committee¹ of Preparing the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region in 1995. The organization was obviously formed for the Chinese government to take over Hong Kong. The Cultural Sub-group² drafted the basic principle of civic education for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region. It showed how the importance of civic education would be for the future of Hong Kong. Nationalism and patriotism education was undervalued in Hong Kong. Following the resumption of sovereignty, the Report in 1998 concluded that the major aims of civic education were to mould pupil to have state national consciousness, social responsibility, respect and obedience of law, equipped with moral ethic concepts and characters. They pointed out that civic education should establish social order, settle national people, and nurture state and society required talents (Preliminary Working Committee of the Preparatory Committee for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, 1995, p. 189)

About the implementation of civic education, the committee suggested that the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region should lay stress on the following contents in the priority order: State concept and national consciousness; introducing the Basic Law; Chinese history and geography; Chinese cultural traditions and ethic morality; democratic education; nurturing individual ideal and sentiment; environmental education;

¹ The organization consisted of 57 members, of which 30 came from Hong Kong. The chairman was QIAN Qi-chen who served as Chinese foreign minister. The six vice-chairmen consisted of four Mainland officials and two Hong Kong vice-chairmen were Fok Ying-tung Henry and Ann Tse-kai. Other Hong Kong members included those were the targets of the united front, such as Li Kwok-po David, Li Ka-shing, Lo Tak-shing and Tam Wai-chu Maria.

² The chairman was WU Wai-yung Raymond and he was a member of the Hong Kong Basic law Drafting Committee.

and international horizon.

However, it was set prominently that state concept and national consciousness were the first priorities of civic education for the coming Special Administrative Region. Concepts of the state would be introduced with the combination of learning Chinese geography and history, sense of belonging and glory as being a Chinese, national consciousness and social responsibility of the state people, civic rights and obligations, and knowledge of modern China (Preliminary Working Committee of the Preparatory Committee for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, 1995, p. 195). About the future implementation of civic education in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, it was suggested the mode of making steady progress incrementally [shun syujianjin, 循序漸進]. Taking a mild mode to nurture state concept and national consciousness could prevent from flourishing moodiness of narrow minded statism, nationalism and racialism (Preliminary Working Committee of the Preparatory Committee for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, 1995, p. 197). It was not required to give up all pre-1997 content of civic education. The part of moral and social education could be retained and enhanced (Preliminary Working Committee of the Preparatory Committee for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, 1995, p. 198). The opinion was nationalistic and patriotic education. The intention of the direction was to educate Hong Kong citizens to be concerned with human rights and democratic citizenship education.

The State Chairman of the People's Republic of China, HU Jin-tao, visited Hong Kong for the 10th Anniversary of the Establishment of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region in 2007. Accidentally, he placed the emphasis on national education for the Hong Kong young people. He obviously intervened Hong Kong internal affairs which was promised by the Sino-British Joint Declaration that Hong Kong could enjoy a high degree of autonomy except for foreign and defense affairs. After this effect, the Central Policy Unit³ of the Hong Kong Government formed the Task Group on National Education of the Commission on Strategic Development in September 2007. One of the terms of references was to propose strategies and plans and to improve or adjust current directions, policies and measures for guaranteeing the effectiveness of promoting national education in Hong Kong (The Secretary of the Commission on Strategic Development, 2008a, p. 2). The head of Central Policy Unit, professor Lau Siukai, acted as the convener of the Task Group, revealing the prominent importance of this Task Group. Many very important persons acted as non-official members of the committee, such as, Chan Cho-chak John⁴, Cheng Hoi-chuen Vincent⁵, Cheng Kar-shun Henry⁶, Cheung Chi-kong⁷, Leung Oisie Elsie⁸, Shih Wing-ching⁹, and Tsang Yok-sing Jasper¹⁰.

³ The Central Policy Unit (CPU) came into being in 1989 and has retained its structure after 1997. Its major function is to provide advice on policy matters to the Chief Executive (CE), the Chief Secretary for Administration (CS) and the Financial Secretary (FS).

⁴ Chan Chochak John was formerly the British Hong Kong government official and he held many key positions including: Private Secretary to Governor Murray MacLehose, Deputy Secretary, Director of Information services, Deputy chief Secretary, Secretary for Trade and Industry and Secretary for Education and Manpower.

⁵ Cheng Hoichuen Vincent was the first Chinese Executive Director of the Hong Kong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Holdings and the first Chinese Chairman of the Hong Kong and Shanghai Banking Corporation Limited,

⁶ Cheng Karshun Henry is a Hong Kong entrepreneur and billionaire. He is the elder son of Cheng Yutung and the Chairman of the New World Development.

⁷ Chueng Chikong is the executive director of the One Country Two systems Research Institute and non-official member of the Executive Council.

⁸ Leung Oisie Elsie was the Secretary for Justice of Hong Kong from 1997 to 2005. She is now the deputy director of the Hong Kong special Administrative Region's Basic Law Committee under the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress of the People's Republic of China.

⁹ Shih Wingching established Centaline Property agency Limited in 1978, which is now one of the largest property agencies in Hong Kong and china.

One month later, Donald Tsang, the Chief Executive, expressed his policy speech which was the first time that it contained the individual national education section. This section had five paragraphs in the whole document containing only 130 paragraphs. He stated that the government should make every effort to promote national education (Tsang, 2007, para. 118). With the attachment of great importance in promoting national education among Hong Kong young people, it could be expected that they could grow to love China and Hong Kong, aspire to win honor and make contributions for the country, and have a strong sense of pride as nationals of the People's Republic of China (Tsang, 2007, para. 118). He noted that the promotion of national education would be an undertaking of the whole community (Tsang, 2007, para. 119). In schooling, this could be done through classroom teaching, teacher education, extracurricular activities and exchanges with young people from the Mainland (Tsang, 2007, para. 119). More weight to the elements of national education in the existing curricula and the new senior secondary curriculum framework¹¹ would be given. It was to help school pupils acquire a clearer understanding of the country and stronger sense of national identity (Tsang, 2007, para. 120). Moreover, the Hong Kong government encouraged more schools to form flag guard teams and to stage more national flag-raising ceremonies, and subsidize more Mainland study trips and exchange programmes for youths (Tsang, 2007, para. 120).

The Task Group on National Education of the Commission on Strategic Development conducted the third meeting on April 14, 2008. The strategy on promoting national education was finalized. The national education that they defined was focused on the nation and the establishment of education for state concept and remembrance. Through national education, it can make each national comply with state law, take care of state interest and undertake state destiny (The Secretary of the Commission on Strategic Development, 2008b, p. 1). Their understanding of national identity was expressed by:

National identity is a kind of the process of mass identification, related to how to establish a kind of consciousness of we-ness of the group belonging to same one country. Speaking in Hong Kong, it means that we are the Chinese and the each other are close related and fellow citizens. (translated in Chinese, the Secretary of the Commission on Strategic Development, 2008b, p. 6)

The researchers can only conclude that these two organizations were constituted by the pro-China governmental officials or elites. The ideas are one-sided domination. Public intellectuals were not included for the generation or consultation of the knowledge content and aim of civic education. If the researchers can note that the power and knowledge relationship, the statement is not the expression itself, but the rules which make an expression discursively meaningful. It is the question of discursive formation. The Moral and Civic Education Section of the Education Bureau issued the revised version of civic education, and it was *to collect a hundred rivers, enrich young seedlings with moral rain: new revised moral and civic education framework* (in Chinese only, which is 匯聚百川流. 德雨育青苗: 新修訂德育及公民教育課程架構) in April 2008. The policy paper did not consult the public. It was only issued as an administrative process. The policy researchers generally did not take note of this policy. Teachers were made known in March 2009 through conducting a conference. It suggested that life events exemplars should be used as learning contexts to enable pupils to realize positive values. Schools should help to enhance pupils' understanding of China and national identity as

¹⁰ Tsang Yoksing Jasper is the second and current President of the Legislative Council of Hong Kong.

¹¹ The new academic structure of the 3-3-4Scheme was adopted for senior secondary education and higher education in Hong Kong and began starting in 2009 where the British education system of 3-2-2-3 education structure was abolished.

the prominent task of Education Bureau to strengthen the promotion of national education.

Unsuccessful Attempts of the Policy Preparation for the Future Citizens

Two policies documents were issued for consultation and finalized as policies on Civic or National Education in 1996 and 2012 respectively. These two documents were the documents for citizenship education which was ever existing in the most comprehensive forms. The explanation was in details through different perspectives and dimensions with the concept of co-centric ideas. The core was the self, and then it extended to interpersonal, society, nation and global world. However, these did not target to the necessities of our society. On the contrary, these indicated that two different policies for generating and making contents of knowledge serving for two different governances. The following is the table to compare their aims of civic or national education.

Table 2

Comparing the Aims of Education for Civics in 1996 and Nationals in 2012

| Aims of Civic Education in 1996 | Aims of Moral and National Education in 2012 |
|---|---|
| To enable student to understand how the individual, as a citizen, relates to the family, the neighboring community, the regional community, the national community and the world, and to develop in them positive attitudes and values conducive to the development of a sense of belonging to China. | Development of moral qualities: to preserve Chinese virtues, including benevolence, righteousness, courtesy and wisdom; to foster universal values, including peace, benevolence, justice, freedom, democracy, human rights, responsibility, respect for others, etc.. |
| Hong Kong and China so that they are ready to contribute to the betterment of the society, the state and the world. | Development of a positive and optimistic attitude: to follow the direction of “Know oneself, Find one’s niche in Hong Kong. Levering on the Mainland, engaging ourselves globally” and put the desirable qualities into practice; to be willing to care about one’s family and to serve society; to be will to act in the interests of the country and people of the world; and to develop a positive and meaningful life attitude. |
| To help students understand the characteristics of Hong Kong society and importance of democracy, liberty, equality, human rights and rule of law, and to employ these concepts in daily life. | Self-recognition: to enhance recognition of oneself and understanding of one’s roles, responsibilities, right and obligations in family, society, the country and the world |
| To develop in students critical thinking dispositions and problem-solving skills that would allow them to analyze social and political issues objectively and to arrive at a rational appraisal of these issues. | Judging in a caring and reasonable manner: to develop the skills of independent and critical thinking from multiple perspectives, and the ability to discern the meaning and values embedded in relevant life events in an objective and rational way, and making caring and reasonable judgement. |
| | Recognition of identity: to build identities in different domains; to care for family, society, the country and the world; to become informed and responsible family members, citizens, nationals and global citizens. |
| | Practice: to develop desirable habits of making rational and responsible decisions with an enthusiastic attitude in various domains, and to be committed to loving out them. |

The first observation was that the curriculum adopted diversified mode which our society should accept diversity and not discriminate the disadvantaged. This communitarian approaches should be generally selected to develop and strengthen our pupils good sense of belonging of our society. Their contrasts were comparable. The expectation in the 1996 guideline was to strengthen knowledge of citizenship, human rights, political democracy, liberty and the rule of law. Such kind of knowledge was classified as international standard of human beings. On the contrary, the 2012 guideline introduced more traditional, cultural and conservative Chinese values. This was something like the revival of Confucian classical values which were adopted as ideological and hegemonic educational strategy for education. Pupils were taught and intended to be more patriotic, nationalized and identified to be Chinese. These cannot hide the real situations of these policies in 2012 after the handover of 15 years’ sovereignty. The aims of education can be set more high-sounding in a

dignified manner. That is to say, the documents sounded very pompous and self-congratulatory. We should not overlook the issues and revisiting the issues in more details required.

As the day came near for the handover of Hong Kong's sovereignty, Guidelines on Civic Education in Schools was issued in April 1996. The first sentence of the document was:

Foreword: As Hong Kong prepares to be the Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China in 1997 and meets the challenges of 21st century, the schools in Hong Kong have the mission to equip our young people with the attitudes, values, beliefs and competence which help them become contributing citizens to society, the country and the world.

The differences of ideas are comparable to that of Moral And National Education Curriculum in 2012. At the Policy Address 2010-2011, Tsang expressed to review the curriculum framework for moral and civic education and to develop an independent subject "moral and national education" (Tsang, 2010, para. 161). The original planning wanted this subject to be implemented in the 2013-2014 school year (Tsang 2010, para.161), not to be 2012. The Hong Kong government issued the document of the Moral and National Education Curriculum and consulted the public in May 2011. The Moral and National Education Curriculum was immediately and strongly criticized as the brain-washing education by the public but the officials always denied. However, it should be observable that the national identity education was put on the first priority on education. The first sentence of the consultation document was:

Foreword: Cultivating students' moral and national qualities has always been the main objective of school education. After the return of Hong Kong to China, promoting national education and increasing students' understanding of their country and national identity have become the common goals of primary and secondary schools in Hong Kong.

The slightly changed statement was re-occurred in the curriculum guide recommend for use in schools in May 2012 which statement was:

Preamble: Cultivating students' moral and national qualities has always been one of the main objectives of school education in Hong Kong. Since the return of sovereignty, promoting national education and enhancing students understanding of their country and national identity have become a common goal of primary and secondary schools.

It can be concluded that national identity was always put on the most important position. It could be observable that the curriculum in 1996 set citizenship education prominently and the guideline in 2012 made national identity be the first priority of teaching national education. Human rights and political education were further marginalized in school curriculum in 2012. Moreover, it indicated seriously that after handing over the sovereignty for 15 years, education of national identity was so unsuccessful that mental project of education should re-state it again and again. The adoption of concepts and values could be compared. Table 3 gave social and individual concepts and values adopted in 1996.

As a matter of fact, to promote a more political democratization and enhance greater citizen participation in Hong Kong society in 1996, civic education was adopted to promote democracy, human rights, civil and universal or global citizenship. On the other hand, recently generated values were set priorities that were listed in the websites of moral and civic education (see Table 4). The government played a more active role in creating a unified national identity after the handover. More values could be classified as collectivism. Social order, collective recognition and national identity were the task to make the required society for the governance of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region. The themes were the promotion of traditional Chinese values,

the avoidance of confrontation and obeying social orders or public interests, a focus on the obligations and responsibilities, not on human rights, of individual towards China and the Hong Kong's society collectively. Pupils were generally told to be morally correct and to obey societal values.

Table 3

Concepts and Values Recommended by the Guidelines in 1996

Universal Core Concepts and Values: Individual

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Sanctity of Life Truth Aesthetics | Human dignity Rationality Creativity Courage | Liberty Affectivity Individuality |
|---|---|---|

Universal Core Concepts and Values: Social

| | | |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Equality Benevolence | Freedom Common Good Mutuality | Justice Betterment of Human Kind |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|

Sustaining Concepts and Values: Individual

| | | |
|------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------|
| Self Reflection Self Regulation | Self Cultivation Principled Morality Well-being | Self Determination Openness |
|------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------|

Sustaining Concepts and Values: Social

| | | |
|---------------------------------|--|---|
| Plurality Due Process of Law | Common will Patriotism Tolerance | Equal Opportunities Culture & civilization Heritage Human Rights & Responsibilities |
|---------------------------------|--|---|

Table 4

Priority Values Adopted by Moral and Civic Education Unit of Education Bureau¹²

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Perseverance National Identity Democracy Participation To be considerate Love and Care Optimistic Confidence Co-operation | Respect for others Commitment Human Rights Social Justice Self-discipline Service Rationality Rightfulness Appreciation | Responsibility Critical Thinking Integrity Sustainability Simplicity Positive Cherish Creativity Flexible and adaptable to change |
|---|---|---|

Concepts and values for civic education were adopted which were individualistic and social collective separately in 1996. The ideas of individualism were suppressed and reduced after 1997. More types of values were selected to serve for collectivism and social order in 2012. The focus was on strengthening the promotion of collective social order and homogenized communist values. The other point caused attention was the distinct Hong Kong local culture which was ever very important and prominent in Hong Kong. The one excellent example was the Hong Kong cultural industry where there were numerous of products such as songs, films and cartoons. These were Hong Kong collective memories and indicated localism of Hong Kong identity which was hardly replaceable or duplicated. So, to understand this policy, the researchers can compare the subject contents further. The following are the details of comparing Hong Kong studies of two guidelines. The areas of study provided in 1996 were much reduced in 2012 at different stages of schooling on one hand. The Hong Kong based teaching and learning in 1996 was reduced by education serving for the government on the other hand. Civic society in Hong Kong was intended to be reduced in size. Localism was disappeared in curriculum knowledge. Hong Kong

¹² Retrieved June, 2014, from http://mce.edb.hkedcity.net/eng/emb_main.jsp

studies were hijacked by the contents of study catering the necessities of China's governance.

About the contents of China studies, these can be classified as knowing China before the handover and national education after the changing of sovereignty. It can be summarized that the individualistic values suggested in 1996 against collectivist values in 2013. Civic education should have its historical and institutional footing. The basic citizenship education should include more discussion on political citizenship, power relationship between Hong Kong and the People's Republic of China and the process of power delegation and empowerment provided by the Basic Law. Schools should deal with politics and education for civil rights and responsibilities. The researchers should not dichotomize nationalism and colonialism. The following comparisons were the other areas of China studies in 1996 and 2012 respectively.

Table 5

Comparing Hong Kong's Contents of the 1996 Civic Education Guideline and the 2012 National Education Guideline

| 1996 guidelines | 2012 curriculum guideline |
|---|---|
| Junior Primary (1) Hong Kong as a SAR of PRC, e.g. HKSAR flag, HKSAR emblem; (2) Festivities and customs in Hong Kong; (3) Contributions of the people who provide public and community services; (4) Children's rights and related ordinances, e.g. UN Convention of the Rights of the Child. | Key stage 1 (1) Establish a loving and living campus and learn actively; (2) Respect others and be able to demonstrate appropriate etiquette on different occasions; (3) Understand the Basic Law and the spirit of One Country, Two Systems, respect the regional emblem of Hong Kong and the HKSAR Establishment Day. |
| 1996 guidelines | 2012 guideline |
| Senior Primary (1) The Hong Kong society: history, culture, population etc.; (2) Hong Kong-China relationships: (a) sovereignty; (b) HKSAR and the Basic Law (3) Rights and responsibilities of Hong Kong people; (4) The Hong Kong government: (a) structure and organization; (b) functions and roles. (5) Welfare and services: (a) governmental, e.g. the Urban Council and the Regional Council; (b) nongovernmental and voluntary agencies, e.g. Hospital Authority, Tung Wah Groups, Caritas; (6) Representative government and election. (7) Communications between the government and the people; (8) Affiliations and groupings in society; (9) Law and order; (10) Current social issues. | Key stage 2 (1) Be willing to take the responsibilities as a student, serve schoolmates and the school with a sense of belonging to the school and establish good teacher-student relationships; (2) Speak cautiously, practice self-discipline and get along well with others in a rational and respectful manner; (3) assume responsibilities towards society, e.g. taking good care of public property, obeying rules and abiding by laws |
| 1996 guidelines | 2012 guideline |
| Junior Secondary (1) The Hong Kong society: history, economy, geography and population; (2) The Hong Kong citizens: (a) origins and identity; (b) responsibilities and rights; and (c) Hong Kong spirit; (3) Development of the political system: (a) sovereignty and legitimacy: sovereignty before and after 1997, HKSAR and the Basic Law; (b) structure and organization of the government: the HKSAR legal system, the Hong Kong civil service; (c) checks and balances: separation of powers, e.g. legislative, executive and judiciary, prevention of power abuse, e.g. COMAC, ICAC, the mass media etc.; (d) electoral system: the tripartite system: legislative, urban and region, and district; and (e) communication between the government and the people: official or unofficial channels; (4) Means and modes of social and political participation; (5) Contemporary and current issues; (6) Issues in relation to a just society: (a) individual rights and responsibilities; (b) democracy and election; (c) rule of law and justice, d. freedom and limitations; (e) equality and discrimination; and (f) concepts of charters, e.g. youth charter, patient's charter. | Key stage 3 (1) Discuss various social issues in a rational and practical manner and show concern for the long-term betterment of Hong Kong; (2) Learn to cope with peer pressure from any inappropriate behavior; (3) Understand the importance of the Basic Law in maintaining the prosperity and stability of Hong Kong, thereby recognizing the essence of Rule of Law and Human Rights as foundation for the development of Hong Kong. |

| 1996 guidelines | 2012 guideline |
|--|---|
| <p>Senior Secondary</p> <p>(1) the Hong Kong society: (a) culture and tradition; and (b) contemporary and current issues;</p> <p>(2) Political authority and legitimacy: (a) Hong Kong as British 1842-1997; and (b) Hong Kong as SAR of PRC from 1997;</p> <p>(3) Central-local government relationship beyond 1997: one country, two systems;</p> <p>(4) Constitutional document and legal system: (a) Letters of Patent and the Royal Instructions; (b) the Basic Law; and (c) the Hong Kong legal system and Common law;</p> <p>(5) Social and political participation of Hong Kong citizens: (a) awareness of social and political issues; (b) means and modes of participation; and (c) contributions of public opinions: the consultation mechanism, others, e.g. demonstration, press and mass media, etc.;</p> <p>(6) Elements of a just society, e.g. human rights, democracy, rule of law, freedom, justice, equality;</p> <p>(7) Means of realizing a just society: (a) constitution and the legal system: limited government, protection of human rights and minority rights, e.g. Hong Kong Bill of Rights, children rights, judiciary and law enforcement; (b) democratic structure: separation of powers, checks and balances, elections; and (c) freedom of speech.</p> | <p>Key stage 4</p> <p>(1) Develop an acute sense and discern the values embedded in social issues;</p> <p>(2) Undertake civic responsibilities, maintain a balance between individual and public interests by adopting a macro perspective and be willing to strive for the betterment of Hong Kong;</p> <p>(3) Actively develop and adopt proper attitudes required for working in society, such as punctuality, honesty, sense of responsibility, as well as those required for maintaining harmonious relationships with colleagues.</p> |

Source: Curriculum Development Council, 1996; Curriculum Development Council, 2012.

Table 6

Compare Chinese National Elements of the Civic Education Guidelines at Different Stages of Schooling in 1996 and 2012

| 1996 guidelines | 2012 curriculum guide |
|---|--|
| <p>Junior Primary</p> <p>(1) Chinese nationhood: e.g. representative symbols of China: national anthem, national emblem, national flag, etc.;</p> <p>(2) Important cities and places in china;</p> <p>(3) Chinese festivities and customs;</p> <p>(4) Children's life and activities in china, e.g. Young Pioneers, Children's Palace.</p> | <p>Key stage 1</p> <p>(1) Enhance the sense of belonging towards the country through understanding its landscape, natural resources and antiquities.</p> <p>(2) Learn about the country's contemporary development, and develop a sense of self-reflection and national identity.</p> <p>(3) Foster a sense of belonging towards one's country, ancestral home and place of residence through tracing traditional Chinese customs and one's/peers' native and ancestral home.</p> <p>(4) Realize the importance of continuation and inheritance through learning the admire qualities and virtues of outstanding personalities from various fields in the country.</p> |
| <p>1996 guidelines</p> <p>Senior Primary</p> <p>(1) Chinese nationhood: (a) geography and population; (b) multi-ethnicity and languages, (c) culture and art; (d) major historical figures;</p> <p>(2) Administrative regional divisions of China, e.g. provinces, cities, counties, etc.;</p> <p>(3) Important national festivals of China, e.g. National day, May 1 Labor Day;</p> <p>(4) Ways of life of people in china, e.g. rural and urban ways of life;</p> <p>(5) current issues of China.</p> | <p>2012 guide</p> <p>Key stage 2</p> <p>(1) Develop an awareness of and concern for nature and environmental conservation through caring about the use of natural resources and environmental conservation in the country.;</p> <p>(2) Learn about the close relationship between the country and Hong Kong in their development, understand the difficulties in the course of collaboration, explore the solutions, and develop a common sense of belonging;</p> <p>(3) Capture the essence of Chinese culture, and put the virtues learnt into practice in daily life;</p> <p>(4) Acquire a better understanding of the situations of the country from a historical perspective, experience and process of exploration and advancement, thereby understanding the directions for improvement, broadening horizons and affirming national identity.</p> |
| <p>1996 guidelines</p> <p>Junior Secondary</p> <p>(1) Chinese nationhood: (a) major contemporary historical events and the founding of PRC; (b) highlights of traditions: origins and development of Chinese nation, thoughts and religions, e.g. Confucianism, Taoism and Buddhism, culture and art, major achievements and inventions;</p> <p>(2) Major contemporary and current social and political social and</p> | <p>2012 guide</p> <p>Key stage 3</p> <p>(1) Understand the country's efforts and achievements made in natural resources conservation, reflect on the constraints and challenges involved, and show concern for the way forward for the country's sustainable development;</p> <p>(2) Show concern for the relationship between the Mainland and Hong Kong, realize the constraints in the country's</p> |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>political issues in china, e.g. modernization issues, etc.;</p> <p>(3)The government institutions in China: (a) structure of the state government; (b) levels of the government;</p> <p>(4) concepts of government: (a) authority and legitimacy: sovereignty, the government and the governed, e.g. consent of the governed, social contract, rights and responsibilities, etc., separation and balance of powers, checks and balances; (b) constitution and the legal system, c. different types of representative government and electoral system; (d) social and political participation of public: means and modes of participation, contribution of public opinions.</p> | <p>development and its directions for improvement through understanding the government organizations and the country's key projects;</p> <p>(3) Learn to appreciate Chinese literature and art, and understand the charm and spirit embedded therein to enhance national qualities;</p> <p>(4) Understand from a historical perspective the development of the country and features of multiculturalism, learn about the present with reference to past experience, and be committed to taking on one's responsibilities as a citizen of the country.</p> |
| 1996 guidelines | 2012 guide |
| <p>Senior Secondary</p> <p>(1) Chinese nationhood: (a) ideology; (b) political system; (c) economic system;</p> <p>(2) Political authority and legitimacy: (a) Chinese Constitution; (b) the government institutions in china: the bureaucracy and the Cadre system; (c) democratic centralism; (d) State and the Chinese Communist Party: functions and role of the Party, structure of the Party; and (e) social and political participation and recruitment: means and modes of participation, e.g. Chinese People's Consultative Conference, communication system;</p> <p>(3) Chinese citizenship: (a) citizen identity; (b) national pride, nationalism and patriotism; and (c) responsibilities and rights;</p> <p>(4) Concepts of nation and state: (a) political ideologies, political systems; (b) economic systems; and (c) nation and state;</p> <p>(5) Concepts of government: (a) the government bureaucracy; (b) accountability and redress system; and (c) public policy making;</p> <p>(6) concepts of citizenship: (a) rights : individual, political and economic etc.; and (b) responsibilities: individual, civic, etc..</p> | <p>Key stage 4</p> <p>(1) Understand one's responsibilities for the sustainable development of the country, and enhance the awareness of protecting natural resources through exploring the relationship between the use of resources and development of the country, as well as examining existing issues, difficulties and solutions;</p> <p>(2) Understanding the impact on people's livelihood brought about by the development of the country in contemporary politics, economy, diplomatic relations and technology, as well as the exemplification of values such as democracy, rule of law and human rights so as to comprehend the close connection between the country and the world and be willing to strive for the betterment of the country and its people;</p> <p>(3) Explore traditional thinking and beliefs that shed light on a positive lifestyle and enrich the very essence of life, and exemplify the wisdom and virtues of such thinking and beliefs in contemporary living;</p> <p>(4) Examine significant events in Chinese history from a macro perspective and make comparisons with major world events, understand, from an objective standpoint, internal hardships and external challenges encountered in the course of reform and opening-up, and realize the adversities, struggles, difficulties, development and accomplishments within.</p> |

The discursive processes were similar. More localized contents of Hong Kong were adopted in the 1996 guideline but the local contents were reduced in the 2012 guideline. On the contrary, the contents of China were much more increased in the 2012 guideline of Moral and National Education. There was taken for granted understanding of the nature if these kind of traditional Chinese culture and ideological Confucian values were required for students' understanding. While the western citizenship education emphasized teaching in the values guiding the relation of the state and individual, the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region's government laid stress on interpersonal, social and moral values. The teaching was relied on education with loyalty to the People's Republic of China. The sense of national identity was based upon a sense of traditional culture, Confucian morality and ideological values which were classified as correct attitude and moral responsibilities.

Even with the differences of these two documents in many areas, the outcome of these two documents was the same. The 1996 civic education guideline was ignored by the coming Special Administrative Region's government. The established government after 1997 preformed a series of education reforms and followed with the revision of basic education curriculum, so that, the old curriculum was forgotten and initiated new themes of education for national identity and patriotic education. Moral and national education originally was the second Chief Executive's last education. After finished all official procedure and ready for implementation, it caused our society protesting against its implementation. As the third Chief Executive carried on his new term of governance,

a series of political crisis occurred and the curriculum had no choice but shelved on 8 October 2012.

Conclusion

Hong Kong has undergone momentous events and changes during this period of 30 years. In accordance with the One Country, two systems formula agreed, the socialist system would not be practiced in Hong Kong and Hong Kong could kept on its capitalist system operating. After the transfer of power to China, Hong Kong faced a serious of political problems. Comparatively speaking, the scenario was differently appeared before and after the handover. The political conflicts were accelerated with the discontents of implementation of “one country, two systems” policy in Hong Kong. It was questionable how the government is ran and that it can maintain high degree of autonomy. As the intervention of local governance is increased by the communist government, people doubt whether Hong Kong can retain its political, economic, social and judicial systems and unique way of life. The freedom of assembly is restricted by the Public Order Ordinance and covert surveillance is the other concern. The tensions are increased by the more radical democratization and social movement.

To an obviously description of introducing citizenship education in Hong Kong during this 30 years, the processes of decolonization and re-colonization are comparable and noticeable. In the political transition period of Hong Kong, the decolonizing strategy was adopted which the power was kept at the authorities’ hand until the last moment. The patronizing and empowering policy was given to Hong Kong people with the so called limited or handicapped political democratization and this political system was not accepted by the Chinese authority and banned. After the handover of sovereignty, the re-colonization process was not taken immediately and it was obviously radicalized recently. However, any intentions of moulding Hong Kong citizens were not successful. The society of Hong Kong did not obey the policy’s intention but politicalized institutions activated people with more in depth participation in politics. The governance was nothing but more challenged.

References

- Curriculum Development Committee. (1985). *Guidelines on civic education in schools*. Hong Kong: The Curriculum Development Committee, Education Department.
- Curriculum Development Council. (1996). *Guidelines in civic education in schools*. Hong Kong: Education Department.
- Curriculum Development Council. (2000). *Learning to learn: The way forward in curriculum development*. Hong Kong: The Curriculum Development Committee.
- Curriculum Development Council. (2012). *Moral and national education curriculum guide (Primary 1 to Secondary 6)*. Hong Kong Special Administrative Region’s Government, Hong Kong.
- Education and Manpower Branch. (2002). *Four key tasks—Achieving learning to learn 3A Moral and Civic Education*. Hong Kong Special Administrative Region’s Government, Hong Kong.
- Moral and Civic Education Section. (2008). *To collect a hundred rivers, enrich young seedlings with moral rain: New revised moral and civic education framework*. Curriculum Development Institute of Education Bureau, Hong Kong. (in Chinese 德育及公民教育組 (2008) 《匯聚百川流· 德雨育青苗: 新修訂德育及公民教育課程架構》香港: 教育局課程發展處德育及公民教育組).
- Preliminary Working Committee of the Preparatory Committee for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region. (1995). *The Documents Collects of the Sixth Whole Conference on the Preliminary Working Committee of Preparing the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, the Standing Committee of the National People’s Congress of the People’s Republic of China* [Quanguo renmin daibiao dahui changwuweiyuanhui XianggangtebieXingzhengqu chouweihui yubeigongzuo weiyuanhui diliuci quanti huiyi: wenjian huibian], Beijing: the Secretary of the Preliminary Working Committee of Preparing the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, the Standing Committee of the National People’s Congress of the People’s Republic of China [Quanguo renmin daibiao dahui changwuweiyuanhui XianggangtebieXingzhengqu chouweihui yubei gongzuo weiyuanhui mishuchu]. 特區籌委會預備工作委員會(1995)《全國人民代表大會常務委員會香港特別行政區籌委會預備工作委員會第六次全體會議: 文

件匯編》北京：全國人民代表大會常務委員會香港特別行政區籌委會預備工作委員會秘書處。

Task Group on National Education of the Commission on Strategic Development. (2007). Report on Task Group on National Education of the Commission on Strategic Development: Situation, Challenge and Prospect of Promoting National Education in Hong Kong, Central Policy Unit, Hong Kong (in Chinese策略發展委員會國民教育專題小組(2007)《策略發展委員會國民教育專題小組報告：香港推行國民教育的現況、挑戰與前瞻》香港：中央政策組).

The Secretary of the Commission on Strategic Development. (2008a). Situation, challenge and prospect of promoting national education in Hong Kong. In the document on the meeting of the Task group on National Education of the Commission on Strategic Development, on 14 April 2008, document number: CSD/2/2008, Hong Kong: The central Policy Unit (in Chinese策略發展委員會秘書處(2008)〈香港推行國民教育的現況、挑戰與前瞻〉於策略發展委員會國民教育專題小組, 2008年4月14日會議, 文件編號: CSD/2/2008, 香港: 中央政策組).

The Secretary of the Commission on Strategic Development. (2008b). Situation, Challenge and Prospect of Promoting national Education in Hong Kong. In Annex B of the document on the meeting of the Task group on National Education of the Commission on Strategic Development, on 14 April 2008, document number: CSD/2/2008, Hong Kong: The central Policy Unit (in Chinese策略發展委員會秘書處(2008)〈香港推行國民教育的現況、挑戰與前瞻〉於策略發展委員會國民教育專題小組, 2008年4月14日會議, 文件編號: CSD/2/2008, 香港: 中央政策組).

Tsang, D. Y. K. (2007). *2007-2008 policy address*. Hong Kong Special Administrative Region's Government, Hong Kong.

Tsang, D. Y. K. (2010). *2010-2011 policy address*. Hong Kong Special Administrative Region's Government, Hong Kong.